Margaret M. Zwisler Direct Dial: 202-637-1092 margaret.zwisler@lw.com

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

FIRM / AFFILIATE OFFICES

Washington, D.C. 20004-1304

Tel: +1.202.637.2200 Fax: +1.202.637.2201

555 Eleventh Street, N.W., Suite 1000

www.lw.com

Abu Dhabi Milan

Barcelona Beijing Munich Boston New Jersey New York Brussels

Chicago Orange County Doha Paris Dubai Riyadh Düsseldorf Rome Frankfurt San Diego Hamburg San Francisco Hong Kong Shanghai Houston Silicon Valley Singapore London

Los Angeles Tokyo Madrid Washington, D.C.

August 26, 2013

Honorable Viktor V. Pohorelsky United States Magistrate Judge **United States District Court** Eastern District of New York 225 Cadman Plaza East Brooklyn, New York 11201

> Re: In re Air Cargo Shipping Services Litigation, 06-MD-1775 (JG)(VVP)

Dear Magistrate Judge Pohorelsky:

On behalf of undersigned defendants, please find enclosed a copy of the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit's August 9, 2013 decision in In re Rail Freight Fuel Surcharge Antitrust Litigation, No. 12-7085 (D.C. Cir. August 9, 2013).

Plaintiffs relied heavily on the decision below, In re Rail Freight Surcharge Antitrust Litig., No. 07-489, 2012 WL 4127623 (D.D.C. Sept. 20, 2012), in their Reply Memorandum of Law in Further Support of Their Motion for Class Certification and Appointment of Class Counsel (see, for example, Table of Authorities, describing the lower court's opinion as cited "passim") (ECF No. 1753). However, the D.C. Circuit has now vacated the district court's class certification decision and remanded the case for further consideration.

The D.C. Circuit's opinion is supplemental authority pertinent to the following issues that defendants raised in their Joint Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification and Appointment of Class Counsel (ECF No. 1689) and Defendants' Joint Sur-Reply in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification and Appointment of Class Counsel (ECF No. 1845):

- 1. Whether plaintiffs' methodology constitutes reliable common proof of impact to the class when it cannot accommodate evidence that some class members did not pay overcharges as a result of the alleged conspiracy and thus generates "false positives";
- 2. Whether plaintiffs' damages model that assigns the same overcharge to all class members in the face of admissions of plaintiffs' experts that the amount of the

allegedly conspiratorial imposed surcharges varies can constitute reliable common evidence of damages to the class.

## Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Margaret. M. Zwisler

Margaret M. Zwisler William R. Sherman LATHAM & WATKINS LLP 555 Eleventh Street, N.W., Suite 1000 Washington, D.C. 20004 (202) 637-2200 (telephone) (202) 637-2201 (facsimile)

Ashley M. Bauer LATHAM & WATKINS LLP 505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000 San Francisco, California 94111 (415) 391-0600 (telephone)

Counsel for Singapore Airlines Cargo Pte Ltd and Singapore Airlines Limited

## /s/ Ian Simmons

Ian Simmons
O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP
1625 Eye Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006-4001
(202) 383-5106 (telephone)
(202) 383-5414 (facsimile)

Counsel for Asiana Airlines Inc.

/s/ George N. Tompkins, Jr.

George N. Tompkins, Jr. WILSON ELSER MOSKOWITZ EDELMAN & DICKER LLP 150 East 42nd Street 212 490 3000 (telephone) 212 490 3038 (facsimile)

Counsel for Air China Limited and Air China Cargo Company Limited

## /s/ Michael J. Holland

Michael J. Holland CONDON & FORSYTH LLP 7 Times Square, 18<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10036 212 490 9100 (telephone) 212 370 4453 (facsimile)

Roscoe C. Howard, Jr. ANDREWS KURTH LLP 1350 I Street, NW, Suite 1100 Washington, DC 20005 202.662.2750 (telephone)

Counsel for Air New Zealand Limited

## /s/ David H. Bamberger

David H. Bamberger Deana L. Cairo DLA PIPER LLP (US) 500 Eighth Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20004 (202) 799-4000 (telephone) (202) 799-5000 (facsimile)

Counsel for Cathay Pacific Airways Ltd.

### /s/ Barry G. Sher

Barry G. Sher Kevin C. Logue PAUL, HASTINGS LLP 75 East 55th Street, First Floor New York, NY 10022 (212) 318-6000 (telephone) (212) 319-4090 (facsimile)

Counsel for Korean Airlines Co., Ltd.

## /s/ Tammy Tsoumas

Tammy Tsoumas David I. Horowitz KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP 333 South Hope Street Los Angeles, CA 90071 (213) 680-8400 (telephone) (212) 680-8500 (facsimile)

Counsel for Defendant EVA Airways Corporation

# s/E. Christopher Murray

E. Christopher Murray Thomas A. Telesca RUSKIN MOSCOU FALTISCHEK 1425 RXR Plaza 14th Floor, East Tower Uniondale, NY 11556 (516) 663-6600 (telephone)

Counsel for Air India

## /s/ James V. Dick

James V. Dick SQUIRE SANDERS (US) LLP 1200 19<sup>th</sup> Street, NW Suite 300 Washington, D.C. 20036 (202) 626-6600 (telephone) (202) 626-6780 (facsimile)

Counsel for China Airlines, Ltd.

/s/ Harvey Wolkoff

Harvey Wolkoff ROPES & GRAY LLP Prudential Tower 800 Boylston St. Boston, MA 02199-3600

Tel: (617) 951-7522 Fax: (617) 235-0224

Attorneys for Defendants Atlas Air Worldwide Holdings, Inc., Polar Air Cargo, LLC, and Polar Air Cargo Worldwide, Inc.

/s/ John R. Fornaciari

John R. Fornaciari Robert M. Disch BAKER HOSTETLER LLP Washington Square, Suite 1100 1050 Connecticut Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20036-5304 (202) 861-1500 (telephone) (202) 861-1783 (facsimile)

Attorneys for Defendant Nippon Cargo Airlines, Ltd.

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Margaret M. Zwisler, certify that on August 26, 2013 I caused a true and correct copy of the foregoing to be served via the Court's ECF system upon all counsel registered for ECF in this case.

/s/ Margaret M. Zwisler\_

Margaret M. Zwisler LATHAM & WATKINS LLP 555 Eleventh Street NW, Suite 1000 Washington, DC 20004